

English 112, Newmark  
Essay One, Peer Review Sheet

1. Please read your peer's paper through one time, without making any marks on the draft. After this first read, what stands out as the paper's greatest strength?
  
2. What stands out as the paper's biggest weakness at this time?
  
3. OK, now please read the paper a second time, with a pen or a highlighter in hand. Please highlight or underline your peer's thesis, his/her definition argument. Please comment below on your peer's thesis in light of the following list of thesis criteria:
  - a thesis must not be a question
  - a thesis must be a focused (in this case, narrow) statement
  - a thesis must not be a statement of "idle opinion"
  - the thesis should be manageable for a paper of this length
  - a thesis must not be a fact
  - a thesis must be a viable subject for lively debate
  - this thesis must follow the basic conventions of a "definition argument" as outlined in class (the student might not follow the simple a=b structure, but the thesis must ultimately conform to the standards for a "definitional claim")
  
4. Which text does your peer address? Does your peer offer an accurate summary of the essence of the text he/she read, early on in his/her essay?
  
5. How many paragraphs total does your peer have in his/her essay? Are these paragraphs organized around topics, in support of the thesis (with the grain) and against the thesis (against the grain, or statements that concede to or entertain other perspectives) and then back to a strong reiteration of the thesis? Comment below.

6. Comment below on your peer's use of sources:
  - Are they "scholarly"?
  - Are these all introduced in the text with attributive tags?
  - Are the sentences that include the quotes *complete* sentences?
  - Do the sentences that include quotes end with a *correct* parenthetical citation?
  - Did your peer include a Works Cited page? Is it correct?
  - Are there two sources (the main text and at least one scholarly source)?  
Are these quotes from each in the body of the essay?
  
7. Please list below your peer's *five* biggest grammar problems:
  
8. Does your peer express clearly *why* the issue discussed in the paper is an important issue (what's "at stake" in this debate)?
  
9. What did you like most about your peer's paper? What is your peer's most insightful comment about the issue and the text he/she discussed in the paper?
  
10. As a reader, what did you learn about the writing of *your own* paper from reading your peer's paper?
  
11. On what do you think your peer needs to work most between now and his/her conference?